

Annals of the Faculty of Arts Volume 50 (January-March 2022) http://www.aafu.journals.ekb.eg

Ain shams university

(A Refereed Scientific periodica)

Metalepsis and Myth: the Myth-making of Estevan / Jerusalem as a Homeland of the Jews in Selected Verse/ Prose Texts of Eli Mandel's Out of Place

Neveen Diaa El-Deen Al-Qassaby*

Lecturer teaching English Language at the Higher Institute of Art Criticism in the Academy of Arts rareroses.nov11@gmail.com

Abstract:

As a Canadian Jewish poet, Mandel indulges with his wife Ann, who acts as a cinematic photographer, in a narrative poetic journey returning to the Canadian town of Estevan Saskatchewan. It foreshadows another past journey undertaken by Mandel's fathers to the same place which forms a hypodiegesis/ a subtext in the main text. The image of the deserted Jewish colonies of Estevan is a metaphor for the Zionist ancestral quest of a homeland. Consequently, the researcher relates her study of metalepsis to that of Northrop Frye's views of myth. In order to elucidate the major forms of metalepsis in Mandel's literary texts, the researcher studies views of a number of critics such as Gérard Genette, Karin Kukkonen and D. Malina. Genette believes that metaplesis is a transgression in the narrative borderline between diégèse/ the textual universe and reality. Kukkonen builds upon Genette's views in her division of metalepsis into ascending and descending. Malina adds that metalepsis occurs as a form of a transgression in the borderline between reality and the other extradiegetic, diegetic and hypodiegetic levels of the text. Mandel finally realizes that he neither belongs to Estevan nor to Jerusalem. Through the analysis of the diverse forms of metalepsis, the reader becomes aware that the Zionist assumption that Jerusalem is the lost promised land is only just a myth.

Keywords: Metalepsis – Myth – Transgression – Diegesis – Hypodiegesis.

② جميع حقوق الطبع والنشر محفوظة لحولية كلية الآداب - جامعة عين شمس 2022.

Metalepsis and Myth: the Myth-making of Estevan / Jerusalem as a Homeland of the Jews in Selected Verse/ Prose Texts of Eli Mandel's Out of Place

Introduction:

This research paper attempts to give an overview of metalepsis in relation to the views of a number of major critics such as Gérard Genette, Karin Kukkonen, Monika Fludernik and Harold Bloom. The journey of the Mandels back to Estevan is taken as a metaphor which connotes the mythical quest of Jews in search of Jerusalem and of the Zionist call for a return to the Promised Land⁽¹⁾. Therefore, Northrop Frye's critique, and study of myth are consistent with the metaleptic context of Mandel's Out of Place. Elias or Eli Wolf Mandel (1922-1992) is a Jewish poet and critic who was born and spent his early childhood in the Canadian town of Estevan Saskatchewan. He has published many books of criticism and verse volumes, such as *Trio* (1954), Fuseli Poems (1960), and Out of Place (1977). Within the main hypodiegesis of the cinematic framework, the visual media of his wife Ann's pictures and their inclusion in the diegesis of the volume double the theme of a Jewish displacement dilemma and maintain metaleptic transgressions. In Part I, pictures are taken of the deserted vault, its broken door and the deserted Jewish colony of Estevan. In part II, there are pictures of the road towards the past/ present journey and some shops scattered everywhere. As for part III, Ann's photography shifts into the graves of the Jewish farmers. In this study, the relationship between myth and metalepsis reveals various literary, aesthetic, historical and religious connotations. Therefore, the researcher expounds a poetry/ prose analysis of metaleptic transgressions and the Zionist fabrication of a Jewish homeland myth in selected texts from the three parts entitled I The Return, II The Double and III A Suite for Ann of Out of Place. Though metalepsis is predominently acknowledged as a branch of narratology, the theoretical background is meant to apply the theories of narrative metalepsis to Mandel's verse volume.

Between Two Worlds: The views of G. Genette, K. Kukkonen and D. Ben-Merre on Metalepsis

In Narrative Discourse Revisited (1988), Genette introduces metalepsis in his comment on the diégèse which represents the framework of the story world. Genette states that: "diégèse is indeed a universe rather than a strain of events (a story) ..." (17). Genette differentiates between two worlds. The first refers to the events which take place outside the story's border-line, while the second; one is the world of the story. Metalepsis refers to "everything that creeps into [the] narrative" border (Genette 18). In other words, any kind of textual intrusion or overlap between these two worlds, accounts for metalepsis.

In the introduction of *Metalepsis in Popular Culture* (2011), K. Kukkonen develops Genette's thoughts about narratology in her discussion of metalepsis. In her viewpoint, metalepsis takes place when the border between the interior *diegesis*, or universe of the text, and the exterior one is broken or no longer exists. She also states that "[m]etalepsis occurs when an author enters or addresses the fictional world he or she created, and when characters leave their fictional world or address their author and their readers" (Kukkonen 11). Kukkonen adds that metalepsis can be explained with regard to three main points: "world," "boundary" and "transgression'" (4). World stands for Genette's definition of diegesis, or the textual context, whose border is transgressed. By giving an introduction to the text, readers metaleptically pass into its diegesis. To constitute a metaleptic text, both the realistic details and the created diègesis of the text become one. Kukkonen discusses boundary as the second main element which distinguishes the analysis of the metaleptic text. Boundary is the border between the textual diegesis and the reality outside the text. In order to expound her comment on boundary, Kukkonen introduces what she sees as an intra-textual or a sub-textual universe. This secondary world is created by the action within the text "[a]s characters within fiction read a novel or watch a film, ... [acting as] readers and authors within their own fictional world and produce a secondary fictional world" (7).

Kukkonen relates the study of metalepsis to the third element of transgression. She divides metalepsis into two main types, ascending and descending. Then she sub-divides the two main categories of ascending and descending metalepses into two forms: ontological and rhetorical. Ontological metalepsis is related to the textual movement and its border-direction. In the ascending ontological metalepsis, the poet or any character can break

the textual borderline, moving from the textual universe to reality. This situation is reversed in the descending ontological one. With regard to the ascending rhetorical type, any character or the poet can interact with the readers. While in the descending rhetorical one, the poet or the narrator can call upon a certain character. In this final, metaleptic sub-division, the dialogue cannot be between readers and characters.

The I for you: A Diegetic Feature of Ascending Rhetorical Metalepsis

D. Ben-Merre (2011), relates the metaleptic text to the shift from the first and the second person pronouns. According to Ben-Merre, the shift from the first person pronoun "I' to the second one "you" and vice versa, is metaleptic. In his view, "[b]ecause the act of addressing a "you" transgresses the supposed boundary between the real and fictional world, fusing the role of character and audience, it can be said to be metaleptic" (Ben-Merre 70). In this state of an ascending rhetorical metalepsis, the true identity of the "I" and the "you" is controversial. It is left to the readers to relate these pronouns to the events in the real world so as to recognize the identity of speaker and the addressee.

Malina divides the borderline which is broken in metalepsis into four main categories. She elucidates that "the borders [are] between the theoretically mutually exclusive zones of (extra-textual) reality, the fictional frame (extradiegetic level), the main story (diegesis), and the story-within-the-story (hypodiegesis)" (1). However, Malina adds that metalepsis depicts not only a break in the border between reality and text, but also between reality and any of the above-mentioned three borderlines. Malina differs from Genette in her viewpoint of diegesis, regarding it not as a universe but as the story which can include another minor theme inside it.

The Concept At A Glance: Fludernik's "Scene Shift, Metalepsis, and the Metaleptic Mode"

Fludernik's views develop the researcher's study of metalepsis. Fludernik introduces a narratological division of metalepsis into five categories. The introduction to the religious pilgrimage of the two Mandels in *Out of Place* and the events/ poetics of the journey give depictions of their first two forms of them. As for the other three categories, they are beyond the scope of this present poetry study. In the first metaleptic form, Fludernik asserts "that the narrator merely tells a story over which he has no power" (384). The second metaleptic category involves a nonhierarchical transition from one textual level to the one before it. According to Fludernik, it "consists in the literal move of the narrator to a lower narrative level of embedded story world, or of a character to a lower (intra) diegetic level" (384). For instance, both Malina and Fludernik believe that the author, character or the poet can make an intratextual transition from diegesis to hypodiesesis.

Metalepsis/ Transumption: Recontextualization and Intertextuality in H. Bloom's *The Breaking of the Vessels:*

Bloom discusses the structure and development of metalepsis in poetry, analyzing verse of some famous poets. Bloom and Hollander believe that metalepsis in poetry is based on intertextual citations or an analogy between one context and another. Bloom enumerates names of some poets who manipulate intertextuality, thus constituting transumption. He relates this intertextual analogy between tropes to an inheritance pattern of images. He stresses that "[a]particular transumptive series in Milton to Coleridge to Emerson to Stevens involves the trope of blankness, at one whiteness or colorlessness, yet oddly also blackness" (Ibid). Reviewing Hollander's views, Bloom refers to a similarity between metalepsis and intertextuality. Hence the next section about Frye's views on myth shows how the diegesis of Jerusalem as the land of Israel constitutes a bond between the study of myth and metalepsis.

Beyond Frye's Myth and Metaphor: Structural Elements of Mythos, Metalepsis and Diegesis

Reading Frye's "The Koine of Myth," discloses an analogy between the two related concepts of mythos and diegesis. In the metaleptic text, Genette's diegesis/ the story's universe and the context of myth can be transgressed. Consequently, Genette's narrative diegesis is a framework for myth. According to Genette, there should be a distinction between the narration of diegesis which includes exaggerations by the author and the world outside of a text with its historical realism. Similarly, Frye attempts to differentiate between the nature of myth and the realism of the historical incidents. The structure of myth initiates a movement backward between

Metalepsis and Myth: the Myth-making of Estevan / Jerusalem as a Homeland of the Jews in Selected Verse/ Prose Texts of Eli Mandel's Out of Place

its Greek primary source and the present context. The same structure distinguishes the metaleptic text and the diegetic breaks. For instance, a critic can recognize hypodiegesis of the intertextual contexts that exist in the main diégesis and relate them to their original sources to realize the significance of their meaning.

Frye relates the language of mythos whether religious or not to the rhetorical device of metaphor. In part I of Mandel's *Out of Place*, there are allusions to the *Old Testament*, and some Jewish rituals. These metaleptic transgressions in the diegesis of the text metaphorically have religious connotations to the quest for the promised land, analogizing the search for the borders of the non-existent Eretz Israel⁽²⁾ to the rituals of pilgrimage. Using metalepsis to break diegesis, is a rhetorical device which can metaphorically relate this diegesis to diverse symbolic connotations. Consequently, metalepsis acts as a main metaphor which breaks the main diegesis to relate it to the metaphorical language of mythos and develop its incidents.

Frye believes that the narration of myth has a circular movement since it begins as it ends. This circular structure in the metaleptic text; causes textual intrusions in the narrative/ poetic diegesis and turns the action into a piece of self-repetitions. To expound this point, Frye mentions the mythos of the lost Promised Land in the *Old Testament*. According to Frye:

Within the *Old Testament*, the climax of the narrative is the return of Israel to its Promised Land, after its bondage in Egypt and its forty years in the desert. Here the leader, Moses, climbs a mountain and sees, without entering, the promised Land. The inference is that nobody actually saw the Promised Land except Moses, because as soon as it is entered it turns into Canaan, and another cycle of history begins (10).

This mythos constitutes the main metaphor and a metaleptic transgression in the narrative diegesis of Mandel's *Out of Place*. It depicts a Zionist call for return to Jerusalem⁽³⁾ and an endless journey in search of the mythical map of Eretz Israel and its fragmented borders. Frye believes that "each mythos/ textual diegesis can be linked to other analogous ones by the use of certain "*cosmology*" images that are recurred by each writer" (10). As an example, Frye mentions the image of the ladder as a symbol of creation. This image is taken from the Bible and is used in other contexts like John Donne's poetry. Frye's discussion of a structure of self-repetition revives Bloom's critical views about metalepsis.

Frye's choice of the *ladder* image leads to his introduction of the term *axis mundi* which relates mythos to diegesis and metalepsis. He defines "*axis mundi*, [as] the vertical dimension that connects our world with the others above and below it. About the *axis mundi*, we can say two things, first, that it is not there, and second, that it won't go away" (Frye 15). In the context of metalepsis, the *axis mundi* can stand for the border which separates diegesis of the text from reality. This border does not physically exist, but is imaginary. Similarly, the diegesis of myth stands for a narrative account which exists neither in reality nor in the time of its narration.

Two Symmetric Structures: Myth and Metalepsis in Frye's Fables of Identity

In "Myth, Ficiton and Displacement," Frye elucidates some of the textual features that form myth, constituting the diegesis of a metaleptic context. Frye differentiates between the structure of the Greek and the Jewish myths. "A mythology may develop by accretion, as in Greece, or by rigorous codifying and the excluding of unwanted material, as in Israel; but the drive toward a verbal circumference of human experience is clear in both cultures" (Frye 32). The structure of metalepsis maintains the two forms of accretion and rigorous codifying. The diegesis of the Greek myth develops by accumulation of narratives. As for the Jewish myth, it gives a codified shorthand of incidents. This process can be verbalized with the use of metalepsis. According to Frye "[t]he two great conceptual principles which myth uses in assimilating nature to human form are analogy and identity. Analogy establishes the parallels between human life and natural phenomena, and identity conceives of a "sun-god" or a "tree-god" (Ibid). Both identity and analogy appear in the mythical sense of Mandel's quest to form metaleptic texts. Frye points out that the structure of myth can move in an ascending or a descending direction. This horizontal scaling stems from the unity between the natural elements

and the diegesis of myth. "The rising movement that we find in myths of . . . birth, marriage and resurrection, and the following movement [is] in myths of death, metamorphosis, or sacrifice" (Frye 33-34). Frye's mythic scale connotes the two major metalepses discussed by Kukkonen. However, the approach of Kukkonen and Frye is different.

A State of Non-Return: Metalepsis and the Route Map of Jerusalem in Mandel's Out of Place

Metaphorically, metalepsis reflects the psychological contemplations of the Mandels who are displaced in Estevan and Jerusalem. The creation of a static state facilitates insertion of metaleptic stories which cause interruptions in the diegesis of mythos. The researcher believes that Ann, a main character/ narrator, introduces a model of ascending rhetorical metalepsis when she interacts with readers. In the preface Ann declares that: Our work proceeded over days. Some papers were clearly accounts, farm machinery bills, shipping invoices, feed allotments, egg sales' receipts, storage charges from the elevators. Others concerned religious matters, the finances of the congregation, salary of the rabbi, attempts to finance a visiting cantor. We assembled all these as chronologically as we could. There were also pages torn from old magazines, including covers from the earliest Life issues, a slim Queen Elizabeth (now Queen Mother) is ball grown, tiara, and marcelled hair, another of Toscanini playing piano with his granddaughter (Mandel 8).

The notion of Hypodiegesis elucidated by Kukkonen and Malina is introduced in the preface which involves the action of Ann and Mandel reading different papers. There is a connotation to metaleptic texts/ "[p]apers" which form hypodiegeses in the diegesis (Mandel 8). Partly the hypodiegesis which Ann introduces questions the Rabbis' tendency to advocate the righteousness of the establishment of what the Zionists know as Greater Israel. The Zionist Orthodox Rabbis attempt to propagate that Palestine should not exist and Jerusalem is purely Jewish. Returning to the roots, Ann and the readers should investigate whether Estevan which can be taken as a metaphor for Jerusalem⁽⁴⁾ is a homeland for the Jews or not. Through reading Malina's views, the researcher can observe three metaleptic instances. The first occurs between the extratextual dimension/ reality and extradiegesis/ the text. The second stimulates a shift from reality into diegesis and the third is a transition from the realism of the diegesis into hypodiegesis.

Ann's preface facilitates the transition of readers into the textual diegesis, so as to manifest a vision of Kukkonen's descending ontological metalepsis. Fludernik has pointed out that this metaleptic form starts from the preface where the lyrical narrative events on the plot level of the journey are in a pause. The prementioned categories of Fludernik's metalepsis are found in the preface. Ann moves from the superior narrative level of diegesis into the lower one of hypodiegesis, memorizing the destined journey of the early Mandels. The description of the setting and Ann's enumeration of documents constitute metaleptic texts/ intertextual contexts. A Genettian metaleptic mode is maintained between Ann's heterodiegetic narration of the journey of Mandel's fathers which takes place outside the chronotope of this text and the homodiegetic one of a present analogous journey. She narrates that:

The dark slid over our shoulders as we read sitting cross-legged facing the bright doorway. A peculiar tale emerged, the pilgrimage west of a man and wife from the east to the place of his birth, home of his ancestors, a search for a lost home. Evidently the place they came to was this farm. The account of their journey often moved us, perhaps because we understood so clearly what ruined heritage they must have discovered, the abandoned house, rusting bedspring, stove weathering in tall dry grass, one spare tilting door jamb framing more prairie only, and this doorless vault open to wind, cold, heat, insects. The last pages were missing but we could see the end. We put down the story and turned back toward the vault (Mandel 9).

Ann indulges in a recitation of a religious mythos that will be disclosed in the upcoming three parts of the volume. To form this mythos, she relates historical realism to the metaphorical language of the textual diegesis. The element of rigorous codifying appears in the main metaphor of Jerusalem which is portrayed as the

"abandoned house" and the "doorless vault" (Mandel 9). To build the journey's setting, Ann relates this metaphorical image to the colour symbolism in the contrast between "the dark slid" and "the bright doorway" (Ibid). The diegesis of the mythos shows that Jews are doomed to live the exodus in search of the mythical boundaries of the Promised Land/ Jerusalem so as to retain it. The light colour hints to the two Mandel's realization that neither Estevan nor Jerusalem can be their homeland which is reached at the end of the journey. Since this timeless myth is characterized by a circular movement, the journey of the Mandels revolves around itself, starting from west (Estevan) to East (Jerusalem). Analogy appears when Ann compares the nature of this mythical quest to the eternity of the forces of nature.

The choice of the nouns "east" and "west" has two symbolic connotations and involves some implications of the technique of rigorous codifying (Mandel 9). East has two allegorical indications. First it refers to the presupposition that Jerusalem located in the middle east is supposed to be the ancestral homeland. Second it stands for the trauma of displacement in a second homeland in Eastern Canada/ Toronto. The noun west reveals the circular structure of the diegesis of myth as it connotes two repetitive journeys. The first one refers to the journey of the early Mandels who have lived as Jewish refugees in the lost Jewish colonies of Saskatchewan. The second journey is that of the second generation of the Mandels, returning to the same place in western Canada where Eli Mandel has spent his childhood. The metaphor of "[t]he last pages [which] were missing" indicates that the second generation of the Mandels are the ones who should reach a conclusion and decide whether Jerusalem "5"/ Estevan are homelands where they should live or not (Ibid). The following lines from the first introductory poem "the return," in part I, show Mandel's tendency to recollect his childhood memories, recalling the dilemma of Jewish rootlessness which his parents feel: the return:

in the estevan poem, for example, how everyone can be seen eating or is it reading

but not everyone there is myself in the souris valley forty years later

Ann

.....

she is taking pictures she photographs me walking away along a curving path the flowers coloured

and

my father appears my mother appears saying no words troubled

and all

the ghostly jews of estevan

praying

in the synagogue of the valley

in the convenant
of coal mines
in these pictures
of estevan (Mandel lines 1-34).

Mandel's retrospections of his family memories have allusions to Freud's Family Romances (1909). The poem manifests the coexistence of parallel texts/ structures. In the diegesis, Mandel stands in the present priaries or outskirts of Estevan, giving reflections on another past image of the same place which he elucidates in the hypodiegesis. Though the two images represent the same place or Estevan as a homeland, they clash at the present time. "All this is to say that Out of Place is resistant to the notion of a mythic return there is no final, eventual meeting between noesis and eros; the places of being and writing may asymptotically converge but not join" (Stubbs 169). The two hypodiegeses which exist in the poem show a flux of time, creating a timeless mythos. The first one places the earlier, past journey of Mandel's fathers in the diegesis. As an instance of a metaleptic text, it also involves a revision of Mandel's earlier poem "estevan saskatchewan". The second hypodiegesis is related to the action of Ann who photographs and accompanies Mandel in this journey. These metaleptic texts show the displacement of the two generations of Mandel's family which can be connotative of the Jewish diaspora. The continuous breaks in the text foreshadow the fragmented borderlines of Eretz Israel which should mythically extend from Egypt/ the Nile to Euphrates.

The first hypodiegesis involves an intertextual context of the exodus myth. Consequently, Mandel employs the trope of metaphor so as to relate the past to the present and to develop the diegesis of this myth. The first major metaphor stands for the collective identity of the Israelites/ the Jewish people of Estevan and their "forty years" wandering the desert (Mandel line 6). Relating this hypodiegesis to the main diegesis of the poem, Mandel stages another metaphor of himself and Ann wandering nearby the "Souris Valley"/ river in Saskatchewan (line 5). The circular movement of myth shows that the past foreshadows the present. Metaphorically, "the ghostly jews of estevan" are doomed to live as refugees "in the convenant of coal mines" and to lead the same destined journey of forefathers in search of the frontiers of Canaan (Mandel lines 26-32). However, the second hypodiegesis, which involves Ann's action of photography, shows the poet's "dream" - like state preceding revelation of the truth (Mandel line 14). The people of Estevan/ the Jewish ancestors are aware that they are not indigenous citizens of Canada/ Jerusalem, therefore they are displaced. In the present diegesis, Mandel's return to Estevan, which is symbolic of the mythical return to the promised land, shows that the images of the deserted colonies of Estevan are not like those of his early childhood. Similarly, Mandel's focus on "pictures," and "photographs" can be allegorical of a clash between the image of the ancient land which is passed from his parents to him and the present realistic images of the deserted Estevan and the demolition of Palestinian lands in Jerusalem⁽⁷⁾ (Mandel lines 15-16). The continuity of Mandel's metaleptic movements from the diegesis into hypodiegesis and vice versa is a structure which foreshadows the model of his family's displacement "for forty years later" (Mandel line 6). Mandel's voice is detached as he is in a state of serenity which suits his attempts to revise the timeless mythos of the lost Promised Land and to reread the history of Jews.

As a poet and a reader of his own journey, Mandel performs two metaleptic transgressions. The first is a descending ontological metalepsis, moving from reality into the extradiegesis of the volume and the second is a transition from diegesis into hypodiesgesis. The researcher observes an indication of Ben-Merre's viewpoint of the "I" pronoun which forms a metaleptic deixis when it no longer stands for the same person. This is due to the coexistence of two contexts and two visions of the same person, Mandel as a man and a child. "Possibly Mandel is merely reversing the relation between "dreaming" and "waking" (or "remembering"), ... to create a feeling for the reality of place (as with Adam's dream of Eve: he awoke, Keats said, and found it truth)" (Stubbs 168). This textual allusion to Keats recalls Bloom's main views of intertextuality and the context inheritance to form metaleptic texts. Another metaleptic instance elucidates an allusion to Milton which appears in Mandel's description of Ann as "pale as a flower/ in the white sun" (Mandel lines 12 - 13). The researcher

observes an indication of a descending rhetorical metalepsis in Mandel's indirect address to his fathers, telling them that he will follow in their footsteps, so as to reach the truth.

Mandel indicates, in a footnote, that the title of the second poem in part I "doors of perception," is named after one of Hulxley's texts. This allusion introduces a metaleptic mode of textual breaks in the diegesis. The researcher comments on the following lines, discussing how this allusion creates a contemplative mode of loss: doors of perception:

roads lead here there
on the prairie Ann holds the Pinto
along great swoops of highway down
from Lloydminster past Batoche
rebellion Rudy's book researched
prophetic voices as a guide
in Huxley's version time curves
upon itself

cities of the mescal dream
turned biblical Jeweled places
palaces of John in Revelation
Blake's engraving the drunkenness
of Smart's madness prophecy
our history is motion curved
like straight correction lines
earth-measured on a western grid
place known through time time
Thompson walked
through unafraid for knowing

ignorant of clocks and vision we accelerate a sweep through dying towns and farms

measurement and lore

Note: Abraham Hoffer, son of Israel, is mentioned in a footnote to Huxley's *Doors of Perception and Heaven and Hell*. A psychiatrist, Abraham Hoffer has done pioneer work in the uses of lysergic acid as a means of exploring the nature and causes of schizophrenia and alcoholism. His father was a wheat farmer (Mandel 15).

The poem's opening lines elucidate a religious texture of the myth of ancient Israel which Mandel's metaleptic text questions its accuracy. In the metaphor of "Ann [who] holds the Pinto" (Mandel line 2), the choice of the word "Pinto" refers to the hybrid ethnicity of Jews who are doomed to live in all parts of the world, having no original homeland. The poem expounds Bloom's idea of allusions which constitutes metaleptic instances. The name recitation of different poets, writers and others who influence different fields of knowledge causes breaks in the main diegesis of the poem. Mandel's address to "Smart," "Blake," "Thompson," and "Rudy" creates a descending rhetorical metalepsis and a cohesion between his poetic context and that of the Canadian poet, Robert Kroetsch's poem "Seed Catalogue". This is also an instance of the *Yizkor* books which revives the memory of the Jews killed in the Holocaust, and intensifies the sense of Israeli nationalism. This tendency can also be taken as an attempt to indulge with them in an internal monologue, so as to assure himself of the existence of the Promised Land. It is as if Mandel were examining the validity of the justifications given by the Israeli founders for the atrocities committed against the Palestinians. Mandel's manipulation of a simile analogizes the line breaks to the

fragmented borderlines of Jerusalem. This turns the poem into a document narrating the mythical quest of Jews and their search for a "place known through time" in the *Testaments* (Mandel line 17).

As a Jew, Mandel who speaks as if he were in a dream-like state does not know on which date he will be united with Jerusalem whose mythical frontiers exist only in the *Testaments*. Therefore, the poem's text is a parallel structure "of Orwell's 1984," being based on a dream-life situation of an unresolved mythos (Stubbs 16). By addressing readers, Mandel forms an ascending rhetorical metalepsis Transpassing the textual borderlines, the readers, who can now share with Mandel his quest, are "ignorant of clocks" or the "time" on which the mythos of the Promised Land and the existence of its borderlines will come true (Mandel lines 7-23). What constitutes a metaleptic instance is the climatic allusion to an Oedipus complex. According to Stubbs "to penetrate territory that is already inhabited [Jerusalem, t]his re-entry narrates the Oedipal drama of prohibition or transgression" (164-165). Both Oedipus and Mandel seek religious salvation from their sin with the mother/motherland. These moral and displacement dilemmas are due to Mandel's awareness that he claims to possess a land inhabited by the Palestinians as the original landowners and partners to the Jews. He is an expatriate both in Estevan/ Jerusalem whose mythos and borderlines are a fabricated Zionist myth.

The *Book of Revelation* and the concept of the mythical return to the land of Israel constitute a main hypodiegesis in the poem. Mandel investigates the Zionist claims which call for a world action to support the return of the Jews, who are exposed to feelings of anti-semitism⁽⁸⁾, to the land of Israel. In order to examine the moral basis of this claim, Mandel makes allusions to writers, Blake and Huxley, who are accused of having a misogynist form of anti-semitism. However, the use of metaleptic transgressions helps to debunk the truth of this anti-semitic myth. Even Mandel declares that his scheme is to point out revisions and "correction lines" of the Zionist/ "curved" history (lines 14-15). Writing the title of the poem "doors of perception" in small letters, this shows that Mandel suspects the Zionist calls for the return of the Jews to Jerusalem, so as to escape from the spread of anti-semitism in Europe. The circular structure of the poem, which is an instance of mythic manipulation, foreshadows a state of non-return to Estevan/ Jerusalem due to the poet's feelings of a colonial guilt. Calling upon members of his Jewish community, Hoffer and Zakus, Mandel discovers that they are not unified by ethnic origion. Therefore, the poet who is "unafraid for knowing" the truth wonders how could ever Estevan/ Jerusalem be a homeland for Jews if they do not have a unified origin? (Mandel line 20).

Mandel's allusion to Aldous Huxley's Doors of Perception (1954) is meant to manipulate the idea of acute hallucinations as part of the search quest for truth and facilitates the existence of hypodiegeses in the diegesis of the poem. Mandel analogizes his situation as a Jew to a drug addict. The transitory state of hallucinations can help him to reach revelations and to face the truth that Estevan/ Jerusalem is not the homeland of the Israelites. The researcher relates the intertextual context of Huxley's *The Doors of Perception* to Arthur Koestler's "Return Trip to Nirvana" (1968). This connection is significant because it stresses a relationship between forgetfulness/ oblivion and hallucinations. Moreover, Koestler is the author of The Thirteenth Tribe (1976) which implies that Ashkenazi Jews are not original landowners of Jerusalem because they are genetically unrelated to the Israelites. It is as if Mandel, an Ashkenazi Jew, were trying to escape the reality that he does not have ties with the mythical promised land. Thus, Huxley's Doors of Perception is allegorical of Mandel's quest for reality. Mandel's psychological meditations are "the hall-mark of an expanded state of consciousness, in which one comes to the realization that physical reality is but a veil, concealing that which is beyond it ... It is believed that one can also reach such states of consciousness through narcotics" (Pinson 32). This explains Mandel's footnote reference to the biochemist Abraham Hoffer and his use of LSD in his scientific studies. For both Orthodox Rabbis and Yeddish Jews, the use of LSD in prayers stands for a spiritual journey of religious mysticism. Arthur Green asserts that "[r]esearch into this area has of course been stimulated by the claims (dating back to Aldous Huxley's Doors of Perception) that states seemingly very similar to those described by the mystics could be induced by the administration of certain "hallucinogenic" drugs" (89).

Metalepsis and Myth: the Myth-making of Estevan / Jerusalem as a Homeland of the Jews in Selected Verse/ Prose Texts of Eli Mandel's Out of Place

Huxley's novel alludes to Blake's poem "The Marriage of Heaven and Hell". Borrowing cohesive intertextual contexts that are traversed from one writer to another, Mandel follows Bloom's vision of the metaleptic mode. In the poem, Blake indulges in a conversation with the Jewish prophets Isaiah and Ezekiel. It gives reflections on the idea that the unity of the body and soul can reveal the truth.

As a hypodiegesis of anti-semitic myth, Mandel makes allegorical references to Markus Zusak's novel *The Book Thief* (2005) and to Rudolf Steiner's empirical approaches. It constitutes a metaleptic transgression in the poem, analogizing the childhood innocence of the young Rudy Steiner to that of Mandel. The novel is thought to give reflections on the idea of the Nazi persecution of Jews. However, the well "researched" thoughts of the novel raise questions about the authenticity of the historical information of the Holocaust (Mandel line 5). Commenting on *The Book Thief* and *The Boy in the Striped Pajamas*, the researcher stresses that "[n]either of these books offers insights about the rise of fascism in Europe or the gradual subjugation and persecution of the Jews during the Third Reich" (Paula Ressler and Becca Chase 84). By making another reference to the character of the Jewish Philosopher Rudolf Steiner in the diegesis of the poem, Mandel gives an instance of a descending rhetorical metalepsis. Like Rudolf Steiner, Mandel adopts a belief in scientific empiricism. Therefore, he attempts to expose the possibility that the European antisemitism against Jews could be a mythic construction, asking the reader to search for the truth.

Mandel employs the tropes of metaphor and allusion to deconstruct and inquire about the validity and the truth of the myth of antisemitism. He makes an allusion to Christopher Smart's poem "Jubilate Agno" which urges the Jews and readers to follow a Hutchinsonian niche and question the religious information given to them by the Rabbis. It is as if Mandel were introducing a model of ascending rhetorical metalepsis, thus indulging in interactions with the reader and other writers and scholars who should now help him to find out the truth. "These favorable general references to the [Hutchinsonian] school helped to spread its influence and encourage people to search the Old Testament for themselves" (Katz 251). Thus, Mandel interacts with other writers so as to know whether the Rabbis' religious explanations of the *Book of Revelation* are right and accurate or not?. This methodology can pave the way for the reader and Mandel to analyze and rethink about the religious information given to them and decide whether Jerusalem could be a homeland for the Israelis, or this is just a myth?

Mandel makes a biblical allusion to the *Old Testament* and Thompson Chain – Reference Bible. He questions the truth behind the history of the state of Israel and the creation of the first temple. Rich Ware considers *The old Testament* as a metaphor, the main trope of myth, therefore it constitutes a main hypodiegesis in the poem. Ware believes that *The Old Testament* "was written by Jewish Gnostics who wanted to create their own history of the creation, their own flood story, their own scriptures, and their own stories of patriarchs, even though the writers knew that the histories and stories never actually happened"(1). Revising the remarks of Dr. Thomas Thompson, Mandel and the reader should realize that there are no historical documents which certify the existence of the unified state of Israel and the temple. Mandel's metaphor of "Thompson walked/ measuring place" is an allegorical reference to Thompson Chain-Reference Bible (lines 18-19). Since, the diegesis of Jewish mythology develops by rigorous codifying, Mandel makes a symbolic reference to the "measurement[s]" of the temple in the book of Ezekiel (Mandel line 21). The archeologist Frank Thompson believes that the "measurement[s]" of the future temple/ second temple in *The Book of Ezekiel* have a different cubit mention (Mandel line 21). This turns the idea of the establishment of a second temple into a mythical record and raises questions which pertain to the authenticity of the history of the state of Israel.

In "Memorial and Mourning" (2019), Christian Riegel discusses *Yizker-Bikher*, as a Holocaust memoire. As such, Mandel analogizes the history of the Jewish workers who work in the colonies of Estevan to their ancestors who are doomed to be scatted everywhere in the world, seeking a Zionist return to the mythical Promised Land. Mandel's metaleptic transgressions and his epic recitation of this Jewish journey make the

volume, to some extent, deviant from the writing style of *Yizkor* tradition. Riegel focuses on the "communal" and "community" based nature as a main feature of *Yizkor* found in *Out of Place* (330). This sense of socialism reflects the traditional life-style of Jews, living in the Jew-lanes or the colonies of Hoffer and Hirsch. Mandel's communion activity starts from his dialogue with readers to his rhetorical addresses which extend throughout his epic lyricist journey. It leads to his use of internal monologues as in the poems "doors of perception," "sonnenfeld" and in the letter sent to him by Mrs Feldman. Since metalepsis causes the existence of a text within another, the diegesis of *Out of Place* alludes to *Yizker-Bikher* in which there are minor texts (hopodiegeses) that form textual breaks. Therefore, in "Filling the Absence," Michael Greenstein believes that metalepsis works "as a trope of a trope, metonymy of metonymy," (26). Ann's action of taking photos to the graves of those who died in the colonies of Estevan not only creates a repetitive hypodiegesis of a descending rhetorical metalepsis but also shows Mandel's self-indulgence in a recitation of a religious mythos. This will be further expounded in the following lines from the poem "near hirsch a jewish cemetery":

near hirsch a jewish cemetery:

ann is taking picture again
while I stand in the uncut grass
counting the graves: there are forty
I think

the Hebrew puzzles me
the wind moving the grass
over the still houses of the dead
from the road a muffled occasional
roar cars passing no one there
casts a glance at the stone trees
the unloving forest of Hebrew graves (Mandel lines 1-11).

In the poem, there is a minor hypodiegesis of a metaleptic allusion to king Solmon's temple. Mandel contemplates "the graves" as if he were performing a religious prayer in front of the mythical temple, so as to be purged from his original sin with his motherland (line 3). There is an intertextual context/ a hypodiegesis which appears in the two lines "the wind moving the grass" and "the unloving forest of Hebrew graves," (Mandel lines 6-11). The lines reveal an analogy with Coleridge's *France: An Ode*. According to Bloom "as an instrument or wind-harp these Coleridgean woods take their ... origin in that harp the Hebrews hung upon the willows above the waters of Babylon, when they refused to sing the Lord's song in a strange land" (96). In this mode of serenity, Mandel who is "counting the graves: [finds out that] there are forty" (20). This poetic line depicts a manipulation of the rigorous codifying which is a main stylistic feature of Jewish religious mythology. His depiction of silence enhances the complexity of the metaleptic text of the volume, having an allusion to the poetry of A. M. Klein.

Mandel introduces mythical allusions to the exodus and Solomon's temple which constitute hypodiegeses in the poem. The number "forty" creates an intertextual cohesion between the mythical story of the Passover and Jewish slavery in Egypt and the life of the Jews in the colonies of Hirsch (Mandel line 3). Due to the dilemma of Jewish rootlessness, the main purpose of exodus mythology is to convince the readers that the Israeli people has a national identity. This viewpoint is what Vander Toorn has asserted in his belief that "the exodus tradition is not so much a historical account as a powerful myth. It originated in northern Israel where it served to provide a young nation with a national identity" (114). Mandel who searches for his "[h]ebrew" identity discovers that he is entrapped in a circular action (line 5). This is because "the wind" which metaphorically should carry on the breeze of his national identity is "unmoved" (Mandel line 17). Another main allusion is to "the gates" of Solomon's temple (Mandel line 15). Wightman believes that "[t]he biblical text offers no clue as to the nature or extent of Solomon's building activities in Hazor: they may have been no more pretentious than the building (or rebuilding) of the town ..." (18). Standing in front of "gates" where there is

"no one," this implies that they exist only in his mind (Mandel lines 9-15). This verse line questions the existence of King Solomon's temple and turns it into a mythical conception. Mandel's quest for truth stimulates historical revisionism of Zionist mythology.

"Lines for an imaginary cenotaph" is another poem which belongs to *Yizkor* books. Mandel recites names of persons (whether real or fictional), living before in the colonies of Esevan, as if they were Holocaust victims. This analogizes the diegesis of the poem to the hypodiegesis of the Holocaust myth which is thought to be the motive to defend the righteousness of the establishment of Israel. Mandel's tendency is either to debunk this myth or to prove the reality behind it. He states that:

george hollingdale bruce carey george chapman Jacob barney mandel William Tell Mandel: sd Capt A.W. (ab) Hardy Isaac Berner

Annie's

son
all the kinds of war
we say out kaddish for
chief Dan Kennedy
singing
beneath the petroglyphs
hoodos we sd
at Roch Percée
Assiniboine songs (Mandel lines 1-17).

The poem is a religious mythos of resurrection. Having an allusion to *Genesis*, Mandel imagines the day on which Jews will be united with the mythical promised land. The poem elucidates a metaleptic allusion to Milton's views about poem writing, as if it were a process of recreation. "True time is the present in which Milton writes his poem, a time in which spirit again creates, as it did in the beginning, and all time in between is de-sacralized when compared to the truth of creation" (Bloom 84). The chronotope of this rebirth is imaginatively fixed by the diegesis or the textual border of this poem. This poetic centrality undermines the poet's belief in this unity with the promised land and debunks the realism of this myth. Since the poem is a religious mythos, Mandel introduces Canadian places to connote a series of Jewish religious symbolisms. "Kaddish" is a Jewish prayer, performed to lament the dead in funerals (Mandel line 11). Symbolically, this metaphor stands for the decay of the Jewish nation who is cursed and lost for forty years and the non-existence/ death of their collective identity. The researcher believes that Mandel sets an analogy between "the petroglyphs," or the Canadian prehistoric drawings and the religious documents of *The Testaments* in which the mythos of Jerusalem is written as the land of Jews (line 14). On the denotative meaning, "hoodoos" stands for a Canadian stone building known in Drumheller as Alberta (Mandel line 15). However, it has a religious connotation to the wailing wall, where Mandel is performing a "Kaddish" prayer (11). The poet needs religious salvation, so as to be reborn in the mythic motherland. The Canadian river of "Assiniboine," can be a metaphor of Babylon's river where Jews have disobeyed God and sung a religious song as pointed out in the previous poem. The textual intrusion between the hypodiegesis of the religious photos and diegesis of the poem is metaleptic.

Constituting a hypodiegesis in the poem, Mandel introduces an intertextual context of the holocaust myths which are based on stories of holocaust survivors rather than history. What advocates holocaust revisionism is Mandel's indulgence in a "Kaddish" prayer and a dialogue with the souls of his ancestors, so as to ask them about the truth behind the holocaust incidents (line 11). Described as "imaginary," Mandel's dialogue with the souls of the holocaust survivors/ Jewish Canadians of Hirsch's colonies constitute a form of descending rhetorical metalepsis. In another form of a descending ontological metalepsis the souls of the ancestors, which enter the diegesis of the poem, should reveal to Mandel the realistic details of "all the kinds of war," Holocaust and European antisemitism, which Jews are supposed to face (line 10). Mandel's address to the Jewish Canadian author "Dan Kennedy," gives an example of a descending rhetorical metalepsis and shows an attempt to build ties with his people (line 12). It is as if the poet were asking for his advice, whether to forget his Jewish mythology so as to lead a life free of suffering or not? F. Stein stresses that "[i]t is utterly catastrophic for reality-testing when a group-myth, fueled by narcissistic trauma of childhood, family and unresolved past, finds mirroring "confirmation" in current events" (30). From a psychological point of view, Stein observes a relationship between the myth of the holocaust, persecution and deformation of identity. Mandel's deformed identity drives him to retrospect a "cenotaph"/ a holocaust memoir, so as to construct a collective identity.

In an attempt to create imaginary land bonds, Mandel writes a "cenotaph" of some of the Jewish Canadian officers/ soliders like "george hollingdale" and "Isaac Berner," making an allusion to the holocaust (lines 1-7). However, the researcher conceives that the choice of the word "cenotaph" implies that they are buried in an alien place, Estevan/ Jerusalem. The idea of "war," death and burial has implications to the holocaust, while the choice of the noun "petroglyphs" connotes to the mythical bond of unity between the Jews and what they call as the promised land in *The Old Testament* (Mandel lines 10-14). However, death indicates disunity and an end of bond with a homeland to which the poet feels that he is a stranger and *Out of Place*. Moreover, the idea of death, and European anti-semitism cannot be taken as a framework justifying the immigration of Jews to alien lands: Estevan/ Jerusalem where they are not indigeneous citizens. Rigorous codifying appears mainly in the concluding message of the poem which is related to the choice of the noun "hoodoos" (Mandel line 15). Mandel's portrayal of death symbolically indicates that the rock remains stress disassociation and an end of relationship between Jews and Estevan/ Jerusalem which they do not belong to.

As a main feature of *Yizkor books*, the letter sent to Mandel by Mrs. Feldman exposes the idea of a Jew who should belong to his community. She introduces the setting as "the ghost Jewish colony of Hoffer" (Mandel 36). The letter can be taken as part of Mandel's attempt to search for historical records which document the events of the holocaust and the history of the persecution of Jews in Europe. It exposes an insistence on the idea of a construction of a Jewish collective identity of the nation, even though it does not exist. However, personal stories, like Mrs. Feldman's letter, do not develop history between members who reside in the same country. This is part of the letter:

647 Maple Dr. Weyburn, Sask., April 7, 1975

Prof. Eli Mandel, English Dept. York University, Tornoto, Ont. Dear Professor Mandel,

Heard you on 'This Country in the Morning' and was more than surprised when you mentioned that your new book on Poetry and Prose will be about the ghost Jewish Colony of Hoffer (or Sonnenfeld Colony which is the correct name).

Whereas my husband and I were both born in the colony and are still carrying on farming operations there and have a great interest in that area we were wondering where you got your information. (Mandel 36).

The letter introduces different forms of metaleptic transgressions. It forms an example of ascending ontological metalepsis, since Mandel transits from the textual diegesis into reality. It also presents an ascending rhetorical metalepsis evident in Mrs. Feldman's possible address to the readers. Ben Merre's idea of a metaleptic shift from the "I" to the "you" which shows an identity ambiguity, is perceived. This deictic shift in Mrs. Feldman's address to Mandel can be understood as an address either to the readers or to the Jewish community.

In "sonnenfeld," Mandel and Mrs. Feldman lament what they perceive as a changed image of Estevan which becomes void of Jews. This picture is taken as a metonymy for the disunity between Jews and the Promised Land/ Estevan. The researcher finds out that the poem expounds two hypodiegeses; one of them is a metaleptic allusion to the occupied territories of the West Bank. Besides being written in the form of *Yizkor* books, the poet draws another metaleptic allusion to the nature Canadian poet Archibald Lampman. In the following lines Mandel states that: sonnenfeld:

Mrs. Feldman writes to tell me I've got the ghosts wrong it isn't Hoffer, she says, I look again at our photographs fading pastrels grainy texture as if it happened long ago

Mrs. Feldman
I say to myself softly
I can't see you in the picture
there is no one there
were we in the wrong place?
who is mistaken?
what can the letter possibly mean
its words in pale blue ink
copied carefully as a will
or a schoolteacher's correction
of a bad essay
on the geography of the west? (Mandel lines 1-21).

Reviewing Frye's views, Mandel portrays a mythos of the promised land as the site of death. Rigorous codifying, which develops the narrative poetic diegesis, is disclosed in a series of rhetorical questions. Mandel as a Jew is historically displaced in the past (having no mythical homeland), in the present setting of Estevan, and in the modern city of Jerusalem. The rhetorical questions "were we in the wrong place?," "who is mistaken?" and the third extended one "what can the letter possibly mean/ on the geography of the west?" show the descending movement of this myth (Mandel lines 14-21). Ben Merre's idea of the deictic shift from the "I" referring to one person to the "you" which exposes identity ambiguity appears in "Mrs. Feldman/ I say to myself softly/ I can't see you in the picture" (Mandel lines 10-12). The researcher does not know whether Mrs.

Feldman addresses herself or Mandel. The second possibility is that the "I" could be either part of Mandel's internal monologue or of a descending rhetorical metalepsis addressing Mrs. Feldman and the Jewish community.

The poem's title "sonnenfeld" gives allusions to Sonnenfeld colony, Jerusalem and the Haredi anti-Zionist movement. Addressing the Jewish community, Mandel gives the premise that they are "wrong" and "mistaken" in their decision to regard a colony in Estevan and the colonial state of Israel as homelands (lines 14-15). What supports this idea is the repetition of the adjective wrong and the choice of the noun Sonnenfeld which has implications of the Israeli colonial existence in Palestine and the opposition to it. The researcher believes that the reference to the title Sonnenfeld in the final climatic verse lines can have a direct reference to the struggle against Zionism and the character of Rabbi Sonnenfeld. Thus, there is an instance of a descending rhetorical metalepsis which is related to the metonymic use of the noun "schoolteacher" (Mandel line 19). The latter stands for an address to an anti-Zionist rabbi whose "correction" of the Torah teachings can debunk the myth that ancient Israel/ the Kingdom of Judea and Samaria has once existed in the occupied territories of the "west" Bank (Mandel lines 19-21). Keith Whitelam stresses that "Palestinian history became one of the 'excluded histories' with the invention of ancient Israel and its location in the Late Bronze-Iron Age tradition: it is likely to regain its voice, its right to representation, with the reassessment of this period ..." (71-72). The adjective west⁽⁹⁾ has a direct connotation to the displacement of the West Bankers for the sake of an establishment of the state of Israel. The use of rhetorical questions develops the circular structure of the hypodiegesis of the mythical promised land. It revolves around Mandel's assertion that he "can't see you [Jews] in the picture" of Estevan and the colonial state of Israel in the West Bank (line 12). The poem exposes the displacement dilemma and a climax of non-existence/ alienation in the alien land of Estevan and in the Israeli settlements in the West Bank.

Since Part I of "petroglyphs at st. victor" belongs to *Yizkor* books, the poem is a metaphor for the holocaust myths. Hence, the choice of petroglyphs in the title is a symbolic connotation to the historical texts which are as old as the pre-historic Canadian inscriptions. The poet advocates a rereading of the historical and religious records documenting this culture of suffering in the memory of the Jews. Rigorous codifying appears in the metaphor of "the sun's wheel" which refers to the hell-fire of the holocaust (Mandel line 2). In the chosen poetic lines Mandel states that:

watching the sun's wheel
great slow metaphors
wheel toward me out of the sun
they take my eyes from my head
they place my eyes on rocks
they take my crying tongue
they wheel back toward the sun
their black hands carrying my name

I remember

the sun his arms failing wheat and skin his mouth warming of hollows and gulleys one eye grinning news about crossings (Mandel lines 1-37).

In "The Aesthetics of Silence" (1992), Ann Munton points out that Mandel's verse reflects the aesthetics of silence found in the poetry of George Steiner, Norman Brown and Susan Sontag. This depicts an instance of

Metalepsis and Myth: the Myth-making of Estevan / Jerusalem as a Homeland of the Jews in Selected Verse/ Prose Texts of Eli Mandel's Out of Place

what Bloom discusses as the metaleptic strategy of intertextual cohesion between the poetic contexts. Therefore, Mandel draws a scene related to "the horrors of World War II, particularly, the atrocities committed against the Jews" (Munton 2). He assimilates this photographic scene of the genocide of Jews to the fictional landscape of the poetic diegesis, as if he were mythmaking it. The extraordinary power given to the linguistic/poetic elements or the "great slow metaphors" flashing from the sun can silence and "take [Mandel's] crying tongue" (Mandel line 7).

In the diegesis of the poem, metaphor and metonymy play a main role to expose the poet's rejection of the Zionist mythic consciousness and the function of the Holocaust Industry, so as to create the nation's collective memory. Hence, the poem's title "petroglyphs" can be taken as a metonymy for the Jewish scriptures which ensure the idea of Jewish suffering, the exodus as an example, in the minds of Jews. In order to confront this Zionsit scheme, which tends to obliterate the memory of Palestinian suffering so as to support the legitimacy of Israel, a new study approach tends to give equal discussions of the two incidents. Khoury Stresses that "[i]n the traditional Israeli narrative, the state of Israel is depicted as the response to a long history of antisemitism that culminated in the genocide of six million Jews. In this narrative, the urgency and priority of saving the Jewish people makes discussions about the Nakba insignificant ..." (116-117). Acting as a reader, Mandel moves in and out of the textual diegesis, performing descending and ascending metalepses, so as to contemplate this scinematic shot of the sun's beams which melt each of his bodyparts. Thus, the personification of "black hands carrying [Mandel's] name" gives an allusion not only to the oppressive power of the Nazis but also to the Zionist colonial nexus of powerlessness (line 9). This is in an attempt to justify the Jewish migration to Palestine. In the concluding lines of the poem, ascending rhetorical metalepsis appears in the poet's address to the readers. Mandel assures them that "the only one/ to follow me would mistake/ my image/ sign" (lines 33-35). The noun "name" is metonymic for the heritage of suffering which Mandel suspects its truth and realizes that he should modify (line 33). The poet who has "always been wrong/ about metaphors" should indulge in a process of clarifying aspects of subjectification in Jewish history (Mandel lines 25-26). Thus, Mandel's poem debunks the metaphors of the Zionist mythology which gives primacy to the Jewish narratives of trauma in order to create a single unified Zionist identity.

The poetic diegesis involves hypodiegeses. First, Mandel draws an image of the death in the Auschwitz concentration camps and the mythical narratives of the Holocaust whose descending movement is symmetrically analogous to Mandel's descending ontological metalepsis. Therefore, in the hypodiegesis of this mythical world of horror, there is a biblical allusion to "crossings" of Jews, which breaks the diegesis and constitutes a metaleptic transgression (Mandel line 18). The second hypodiegesis depicts Greek mythological hyperboles of the androgyne sun which swallows Mandel as a Jew. As a pun for the Nazis, the "sun's wheel" has a mythical power of a hell fire which gradually takes all his senses, leaving the man motionless (Mandel line 2). E.F. Dyck focuses on the religious symbolism of the sun, relating it to the sun-god of the Greek mythology. He states that "the poet confronts the sun-god whose minions, "great slow metaphors," remove him from the presence of the god, take his eyes and tongue, and return to the god carrying his name" (Dyck 38). Mandel employs this Greek mythological texture so as to rewrite his Jewish history of repression by the Nazis. This hypodiegesis of the poem is also related to the Greek notion of the nostos which stands for the return of the hero to his homeland. However, the holocaust landscape, the textual spaces and metapletic intrusions bring upon a double feeling of not belonging to a homeland. This point will be further discussed in the second part of the poem.

The metaleptic texts have an allusion to Freud. This influence appears in Mandel's reaction against the mythical fire of the holocaust. "The blank, being both unwritten page and unviewable void or abyss would be for Freud the image of primal repression, a defense prior to any drive against which we need to be defended" (Bloom 78). Blankness stands for Mandel's spaces between the poetical lines and the pages left for Ann's pictures, forming metaleptic transgressions.

As for the second hypodiegesis, the destructive, superpower of the sun has a mesopotamian Jewish religious significance. It alludes to "Nicholas of Cusa's Hermetic notion that the Hebrew God is both male and female" (Bloom 84). Mandel refers to this androgyne god, Shamash/ Utu in the poetic line "now my drawings of god" (10). Though Mandel attempts to experience the holocaust like his ancestors to build a sense of collective identity, his portrayal of a sun god shows that the world which he depicts is mythic. It is as if the poet implied that the Zionist narratives should be debunked. The metaleptic text of the poem shows an allusion to the Jewish Canadian poet A. M. Klein. This explains Mandel's focus on space depiction, analogizing the sun god to a nazi who is "warning of hollows and gulleys" (line 6). "After the Holocaust and Klein's subsequent lapse into silence, other Jewish-Canadian poets [like Mandel] pay homage to him and repeat images of blanks, leaves and cries" (Greenstein 29). As a form of a metaleptic transgression, an influence of the *Yizkor* books appears in Mandel's deictic choice of the "wheat" which is an allusion reviving the memory of "a farmer's son, Abraham Hoffer" (line 15). The sun's burning light metaphorically shows an influence of William Blake. Cooley states that "[t]he light ... induces us into, visionary landscape, one that is known by the mind's eye as much as, to use Blake's wonderful phrase, any corporeal eye" (97). Cohesive content is an indication of a metaleptic mode.

The poem "the crooked gods," dramatizes a series of four hypodiegeses existing in the main diegetic action of Mandel's journey. The first one reflects a Greek mythological texture which leads to other historical and religious hypodiegeses related to the holocaust and the religious curse of Jews. The latter are exposed to a religious curse similar to the Greek mythos of the house of Atreus whose family members are cursed for five generations. The fourth hypodiegesis is of Ann's action of cinematic photography, taking pictures of those Greek dieties. Mandel portrays the standstill condition of the holocaust victims whose "photographs/ [are] silent/ as/ their open mouths" (lines 21-24).

"The crooked gods," presents interrelated mythological textures contextualized in a setting of an enchanted land whose inhabitants are loathsome and odious Greek dieties. The poem's second hypodiegesis shows an allusion to God's curse and the figure of the Wandering Jew. In this cinematic shot of a desert-like land, Mandel manipulates rigorous codification of the holocaust. Mandel assimilates the image of his Jewish nation to the metaphor of "the crooked gods" (line 11). Giving three descending rhetorical addresses, the first involves a codification of Mandel's communications with the ancestors or the cursed Jews. Then he addresses those who are burnt by the "last light wheeling" or the holocaust victims (Mandel line 12). The third communication is with the Jewish farmers of Estevan. The following is the text of the poem:

do they mean anything?
I ask Ann
parkland
rolling below sandstone
silent
she turns
the camera
here
there
I kneel
before the crooked gods
last light wheeling

over the land their handprints their great feet their stone faces move
turning
we leave
take with us
photographs
silent
as
their open mouths (Mandel lines 1-24).

In "the crocked gods," Mandel's projection of an image of cursed people has connotations to the exodus myth and the concept of the Wandering Jew which are considered as a catalyst for anti-semitism. Metaphorically, Mandel magnifies the suffering of Jews and the persecution against them, so as to doubt and debunk the Zionist mythology. The Zionist project develops fragmented narratives and realities in order to construct a collective memory and justify the colonial existence in Palestine. Hesse stresses that "[t]he Exodus myth was not only transformed into a historical source for the creation of a Jewish nation and homeland, but Zionism also linked the forty years of wandering in the desert to the Jewish existence in exile" (56). In the diegesis of the poem, Mandel depicts a mythic structure which narrates the story of deformed gods who have "great feet/ stone faces" and "open mouths" (lines 15-24). The poet's tendency to exaggerate moans and groans of those deformed gods and the researcher's analysis of the mythic structure of Mandel's journey expose a subversion of meaning.

Dennis Cooley discusses Mandel's portrayal of a poetics of silence similar to the serenity of a religious ceremony. In order to reach religious atonement, Mandel performs a subverted Kaddish prayer lamenting his ancestors who have belief in the Zionist mythologies, the Sabra Jew as an example, and advocating them to give up their culture of suffering. His manipulation of space between verse lines is indicative of a state of serenity and the use of the metaleptic mode in his search for the fragmented borderlines of his mythical homeland. The portrayal of "crocked gods," metaphorically foreshadows the intimacy of silence and a collective feeling of a displaced existence in the alien lands of Estevan/ Jerusalem (Mandel line 11). Within the religious hypodiegesis, Mandel makes a biblical allusion to Satan. Acting like the cursed Satan who is doomed to live outside paradise, Mandel approaches the mythical land of those deities, a historical allusion to Jerusalem, stands near it for a short time and then he leaves. "[T]his [metaleptic] strategy is actuated within a myth of [Satan's] return and the impossibility of return: a binary structure of opposites" (Stubbs 175).

Since the Jewish diaspora do not have a place memory for the promised land, Mandel's unvoicable dialogue with the Greek deities reveals an attempt to impose a national memory. What doubles a sense of loss is the absent image of childhood memories in Estevan. Silence discloses the traumatic realization that homeland does not exist neither in the past nor in present. The metaleptic shift from the hypodiegeses of religious allusions and Greek mythology to the diegesis of the poem and the hypodiegesis of Ann's photographs reflects an uncertainty about the realism of Jewish history in Jerusalem.

As an instance of a metaleptic transgression, *the Book of Ezekiel* forms a religious hypodiegesis in this poem. The desert like setting of the "parkland" can be connotative of the lost mythical promised land and the non-existent Jewish colony of Hirsch (Mandel line 3). There is a rigorous codification and a metaleptic allusion to the prophecy of the past destruction of Jerusalem and the future regeneration of Israel, an invented new memory, that is stated in the Book of Ezekeil. However, Ann's photography elucidates the centrality of the textual action dramatizing a double indifference to the Canadian landscape and the dream-like thought of a promised land in Jerusalem. Moreover, the chiastic structure of the poem elucidates Mandel's subversion of the prophecy implying a final destruction of the mythical land/ homeland without a possibility for rebirth. The hypodiegesis of Greek mythology shows an allusion to the deformed god of war, Hephaestus. Addressing

deformed gods and standing in a waste land, the poet stresses a disunity between him and Estevan/ the promised land.

Mandel's Poetics of a Shadow Reflection: An Echoic Model in "The Double"

In the second section "The Double," each poetic event and the displacement dilemma are doubled. The poem "doubles: estevan" elucidates a hypodiegesis and a metaleptic allusion to the *Book of Genesis*. In the poetic diegesis of the poem, the cinematic/ religious textures which constitute main hypodiegeses, give an image of the theme of the double. The two main "doubles" in the poem are the "paler sunlight" of Israel's rebirth and the "pale" image of this "washed-out film" (Mandel lines 2-4). Standing on the platform of an "Orpheum" theatre, the poetic action oscillates between birth of the land/ rebuilding of the Kingdom of Judah and its demolishment (line 1). The researcher's analysis exposes a revisionist perspective on this myth of Israel's rebirth refuting the possibility of a future regeneration in Estevan/ Jerusalem. In the following lines, Ann's cinematic shots elucidate an opposite image of degeneration:

1

The Orpheum shows a desert film in Ann's picture the Orpheum is pale against a paler sunlight a washed-out film: someone who could be me stands beside a sweet shop that the Mathers ran for boys whose faces had been ruined On such illusions we have built our lives palaces of art where Sara dreams her precious dream of being

all that

every image makes impossible and true

.....

I stand

Inside the film and stare

At places that I never knew (Mandel lines 1-20).

In the section of "The Double," Metalepsis shows that Mandel's doubled and split self as a poet is divided between his image as a Wandering Jew and a creative writer/ actor. The section "comprise[s] the writer with his tragi (serious) – comic (rhetorical) vision" (Dyck 39). Ed Jewinski believes that "Mandel rewrites Yeats by using repetition to repeat himself ..." (52). Mandel's focus on the theme of double and a cohesive dialogue between him and Yeats dramatize Bloom's idea of the metaleptic style. The deictic transformation from "I" to "we" revives Ben-Merre's discussion of ambiguity in address as a metaleptic feature. In the textual diegesis, the shift from the "I" to "we" constitutes either an address to the readers and an ascending rhetorical metalepsis or a call to Ann and a descending rhetorical one.

The poet subverts the myth of Israel's rebirth, giving a poetic episode about images of mythical degenerated lands. Metaphorically, Mandel stress that "every image makes impossible and true" revelation that he does not have a homeland to belong to (line 11). Personifying the Jewish colony of Estevan and Biblical Israel as the "Mathers," Mandel stresses his narrative knowledge of the two ironically homelands (line 5). In the cinematic hypodiegesis, Ann who plays the role of a "film" photographer, documents Mandel's final traumatic realization that he has lived "at places that [he] never knew" (lines 19-20). Mandel's knowledge of the so called unified monarchy of Israel comes from the Jewish scriptures rather than historical-based references. Many archaeological references elucidate that the Jewish claims to such a unified kingdom in Jerusalem are mere "illusions" (Mandel line 7). Israel Finkelstein and Neil Asher believe that "the biblical story of David and Solomon are fictions, historically questionable, or highly exaggerated [they present] archaeological

evidence to show that there was no united monarchy of Israel in the way that the Bible describes it" (21). Mandel's displacement dilemma is doubled. The present non-existence of the Hirsch settlement parallels the past mythic account about ancient Israel. The metonymic choice of "palaces of art," which stands for the fallacy of ancient Israel, denotes the chiastic structure of a myth (Mandel line 8). Staging the poem on an "Orpheum" platform, the poet's contrast between the two colours "sunlight" and "pale" light creates a mythic atmosphere (Mandel lines 2-3). Analogizing the context of the "ruined" Jewish colony of Estevan to that of Jerusalem, the poet implies that there is an "impossibl[ity]" for establishing a homeland only for Jews in the two lands (Mandel lines 6-11). The poet's journey reveals that the establishment of the mythical state of Israel in Jerusalem is a colonial existence.

Language and a Mythopoetic Methodology of Placement/ Displacement in "A Suite for Ann"

In the third and the final section "A Suite for Ann," the poem "Strange Places" acts as a metaphor which analogizes the displaced native Hebrew language to a double equal displacement in Jerusalem/ Estevan. In "Rehearsals for a self," Ian Sowton states that "it [this section] poses two selves, strangely placed and displaced, at a gently rocking intersection of where, here, there" (17). The metaleptic framework equates reality with the textual diegesis and the ontological scale between the two levels disappears. This mythopoetic form of self/ linguistic estrangement will be expounded in an analysis of the poem:

Strange Places

the places that we go are strange but stranger that we go to place our strangeness where we neither known we were nor where but only that the place we know is neither but the way that tells us we have been not only here but where there was the telling it was so we did not choose it it was so (Mandel lines 1-13).

Mandel's fragmented lines which echo the metaleptic fragmentations of the diegesis, expose the poet's double feeling of disunity with the homeland. The use of "strange" as a derivational adjective, recalls the mythical concept of the Wandering Jew and stresses the poet's feeling of an outsider even in his Jewish community (Mandel line 1). Language acts as a metaphor for an alien person who either enforces a colonial existence in Jerusalem or lives as a "stranger" in Estevan/ "the place [the Jews] know ..." (Mandel lines 2-5). As a Jew, Mandel's manipulation of the fragmented structure of "neither" forms and the double negation stresses that he lives in mythical places which he does not "know" (lines 4-5). The concluding lines show that the language fragmentation becomes in a state of oneness with the diegesis of the poem and the metaleptic transgressions. The repetition of the phrase "it was so," the symmetric line gaps and the omission of the conjunction "but" before and after the verse line "we did not choose it" prove that the pain of unbelonging is doomed to exist (Mandel lines 9-13). The researcher refutes Mandel's affiliation to his Jewish community in his assertion that Jews "did not choose" to live as outsiders (line 11). This is because in the context of the poet's geographical allusion to Jerusalem, the Israelis are the ones who ironically choose to be colonizers of the city and the whole country. However, the poet's use of negation forms prove that he is *Out of Place* in the two cities of Estevan and Jerusalem. "'Place'" is both geographical and cultural: ... "Out of Place" is a doubled

duplicity: each of the two senses of "place" is split in two by the phrase "out of," which may mean either "come from" (as in origination) or "no longer belonging to" (as in alienation)" (Dyck 37). The poet, who is neither a native speaker nor a native citizen in Estevan/ Jerusalem, stresses that he cannot consider any one of them to be his homeland.

The deictic focus on the pronoun "we," shows that the Mandels and the readers who form a descending ontological metalepsis share the mythic centrality of this journey. This state of living in an endless journey is doubled by the use of repetitive, person centered language. This language repeats itself in the diegesis to reveal the sense of "strangeness" in "place" or "places" and time (Mandel lines 1 - 5). Mandel starts some of his lines with a conjunctive tool or with a verb, the latter happens only in one example, to give a double sense of a linguistic loss of meaning. Language repetition shows that the poet is entrapped in a continuous search for his mythical homeland/ the non-existent Jewish settlement of Estevan. "[B]y making the indefinite pronoun silently repeat what is said above while also making it function as the object in one phrase and the necessary subject of the next phrase, Mandel again forces the reader to reread (to repeat) in order to regain a sense of the passage" (Jewinski 49). Unlike the poems in the previous two sections, the title of this poem is written in capital letters, so as to highlight that the thought of Estevan and Jerusalem as two homelands is narratively constructed.

Conclusion

A study of selected poems and prose texts of Mandel's Out of Place elucidates the points of similarities which relate metalepsis to myth. Genette's concept of diegesis is defined as the textual universe which includes all the ontological levels of narration such as the story and the subtext or the hypodiegesis. According to him, metalepsis appears as a kind of a transgression in the textual diegesis, breaking the borderline between reality and the text. This transition from reality into text forms what Kukkonen later defines as the descending ontological metalepsis, while the ascending ontological one is formed in reverse. Kukkonen discusses the stylistic features of metalepsis, dividing it into four categories which include the ascending/ descending rhetorical. The latter is related to the address - forms. Ben-Merre tackles the deictic shift from the "I" to the "you" as a feature of the metaleptic text, reflecting a state of uncertainty about the identity of the addressed person. Malina focuses on the four borders namely; reality/ extra textual, textual universe/ extra diegetic, diegesis and hypodiegesis that are transgressed in metalepsis. Fludernik considers the introduction or the preface as the starting point where the narrative level is in a paused status, therefore metalepsis can be structurally introduced to the text. Both Fludernik and Malina believe that a transition from one higher narrative/ textual level to a lower one can form a metaleptic transgression in the main diegesis. Bloom believes that each poet borrows images or cohesive contexts from his/ her descedents, giving an example of the image of "whiteness". As a field subject to ongoing research in the poetic studies, this review leads the researcher to consider Mandel's Out of Place, as one of the best examples that can illustrate the study of metalepsis.

A reading of Frye's *Myth and Metaphor*, helps the researcher to discuss the analogy between myth as a hypodiegesis and the textual diegesis. If the first exists in the second, this forms a metaleptic mode which elucidates the relationship between myth and diegesis as its narrative world. Since myth has the same narrative centrality of metalepsis, there is an interrelated relationship between the two. In *Fables of Identity*, Frye points out that myth is formed either by accretion, building upon previous events or by rigorous codifying which is a codification of events into symbols. Metalepsis relates the rigorous codifying of diegesis to previous sources, making allusions to other poets/ writers.

Out of Place centers around the idea of returning back to the roots Estevan/ Jerusalem. Searching for a homeland, the Mandels have contemplated the deserted Jewish colonies of Estevan realizing that the place is alien to them. In the preface, Ann the cinematic photographer, who pictures the place and her photos form metaleptic intrusions in the diegesis, asserts that this mythical journey reflects another past one of the ancestors or Mandel's fathers. She enumerates a series of imaginary documents which they should read throughout their journey. This introduces the researcher to the use of metalepsis, maintaining textual breaks in the diegesis

which foreshadow the silence of Mandels stopping at Estevan to contemplate the road towards their mythical Promised Land. Analyzing many poems that belong to part I "The Return," the researcher can observe allusions to diverse poets and writers. Mandel either mentions their names as in the poem "doors of perception," or manipulates intertextual contexts that reflect the influence of previous poets such as Milton, Yeats, Klien, Coleridge, Stevens and Blake. There is also the manipulation of photography, Greek Mythology and religious and historical texts that form hypodiegeses, existing in the diegesis of each poem. All these texts expound the different metaleptic forms in each poem, thus relating myth to metalepsis. Reading the preface, the researcher realizes that the volume belongs mainly to the descending ontological metalepsis. This is due to the movement of the readers and the two Mandels from reality to the textual diegeses, so as to undergo the same journey. Similarly, Mandel's addresses to Ann and his calls to those who died in the poems that dramatize the mythos of death like "the crocked gods," give examples of descending rhetorical metalepsis. However, the analysis of diverse poems and texts expounds other forms of ascending ontological and rhetorical metalepses existing in each diegesis. Relating the first poem "the return" in part I, to "doubles: esteven" of section II "The Double," Mandel creates a circular structure which stresses the mythical existence of the promised land. As for the poem "Strange Places" of section III, "A suite for Ann" it foreshadows Mandel's displacement dilemma due to his realization that he cannot consider Estevan/ the mythical Eretz Israel as his homeland. Therefore, the Hebrew tongue, which is displaced in the diegesis of the poem and in reality, foreshadows the illegal colonial existence of the state of Israel.

المستخلص:

الانصراف والأسطورة: استيفان/ القدس وصناعة أسطورة الوطن لليهود في مختارات شعرية ونثرية من ديوان خارج المكان للشاعر إيلي ماندل

نيفين ضياء الدين

تتناول الباحثة مفهومي الانصراف والأسطورة في مختارات للشاعر إيلي مانديل (1922-1992). ووصف جانيت الانصراف/ metalepsis بكونه ذلك التعدّي على عالم القصية سواءً بالدخول أو الخروج منه. وقسمت كوكنن الانصراف إلى عدة أنواع. ورأت الباحثة أن ديوان خارج المكان يشتمل على العديد من الأمثلة والأنواع المختلفة لمفهوم الانصراف. وأضاف بلوم أن الانصراف قد يحدث عن طريق توارث الصورة المجازية من شاعر لآخر. ثم تناولت الباحثة الأسطورة وذلك في ضوء آراء نورثروب فراي. وأوضحت الباحثة اشتمال النصوص المُختارة على أنواع مختلفة من الانصراف، كما ركزت على اعتماد الشاعر أساليب لتحقيق الانصراف مثل الإشارة، وذلك من خلال مخاطبة ومحاكاة شعراء آخرين كما قام الشاعر بخلق نصوص ضمنية داخل عالم السرد الشعري الواحد من خلال التركيز على الأسطورة اليونانية، كما في قصيدة «الآلهة المعقوفة» كما فيكتور». هذا غير الأساطير الدينية اليهودية مثل النزوح/ exodus واليهودي التائه كما في قصيدة «الآلهة المعقوفة» كما استخدم الشاعر نموذجًا أدبيًا معروفًا وهو «يذكر بخير» "Yizkor bikher" وذلك من خلال مخاطبة الأموات كما في قصيدة وتصوير مستعمرة هيرش اليهودية المهجورة والتي تقع على مقربة من استيفان وتضمينها داخل الديوان مما خلق إطارًا أسلوبيًا عامًا يشتمل على مفهوم الانصراف. وأوضحت الباحثة أن الهدف الرئيسي من تلك الرحلة هو التساؤل حول مصداقية وصحة أسطورة العودة الوطن المزعوم أو استيفان التي ترمز للقدس.

كلمات مفتاحية: الانصراف، الأسطورة، التعدي، الحكى، الحكى الضمني.

Reference

(1) In *Ten Myths about Israel* (2017), Ilan Pappé refuted the Zionist assumption that Palestine/ Israel was an unpopulated land/ region and the Jewish settlers were the first to come to this land.

(2) For further information about the non-existence of a united monarchy of Israel and the Zionist fabrications of history, see Thompson, Thomas L. *The Mythic Past: Biblical Archaeology and the Myth of Israel*. Basic Books Group, 1999.

- (3) The editor Roger Sheety believes that the establishment of the state of Israel is and was colonial. His testimony proves that the demolition of the Palestinian lands should be thought of as a world crime. The researcher adds to this belief that even the colonial operations are not enough for the Israelis to overcome the problem of border delimitation and to enforce the complete existence of the boundaries of the dream state of Eretz Israel. See Sheety, Roger. "Stealing Palestine: A Study of historical and cultural Theft". June 17, 2014: http://www.middleeasteye.net/essays/stealing-palestine-study-historical-and-cultural-theft.1001196809. Accessed June 30, 2019.
- (4) Though, the words of the historian Khaldoun Samman are neutral, he clearly states that Israel advocates ideological racism, defending the existence of the Israelis and the expulsion of the Arab Palestinians. For further information about the racist ideology of a mono-religious Jewish state, see Samman, Khaldoun. "Zionism and the Nationalism of Jerusalem". *Macalester International*, vol.23, article 17, Spring 2009, pp. 221-253. http://digitalcommons.macalester.edu/macintl/vol23/iss1/17. Accessed 8 June 2019. You can also see Kanaaneh, Rhoda. "Stateless Citizens and Menacing Men: Notes on the Occupation of Palestinians inside Israel". *Every*day *Occupations: Experiencing Militarism in South Asia and the Middle East*, edited by K. Visweswaran. University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013.
- (5) Reviewing major periods in history of Jews, the journalist Yossi Gurvitz refutes the ever existence of a homeland for the Jews in Jerusalem. See Gurvitz, Yossi. "*Tom Friedman's Belief in an 'ancestral homeland' is a toxic myth and not history-Updated*". The shift, https://mondoweiss.net/2019/03/friedmans-ancestral-homeland-is-a-toxic-myth. Accessed 31 July 2019.
- (6) All the titles of the discussed poems in this paper are written by Mandel in small letters with the exception of the poems in the third section which is entitled "A Suite for Ann".
- (7) David F. Noble believes that the western capitalist history propagates that the Jewish people should return to the promised land. It is a claim which he refutes and the researcher considers to be part of an influence of Jewish messianism. See Noble, David F. Beyond the Promised Land: The Movement and the Myth. Between the Lines, 2005, pp.224.

- (8) The sociologist John Rose refutes the assumption that the Jews were exposed to anti-semitic prejudice or violence. It is a Zionist propaganda to justify the colonial disposition of Palestinians. See Rose, John. "The Mythys of Zionism". Pluto Press, 2004, pp. 248.
- (9) For Further information about the dispossession of the Palestinians, See Bregman, Ahron. "West Bank and Jerusalem". *Cursed Victory: A History of Israel and the Occupied Territories*. Penguin, 2014, pp.352.